This is a pre-copyedited, author-produced version of an article accepted for publication in Western Historical Quarterly following peer review. The version of record Joy Porter, Chief Thunderwater: An Unexpected Indian in Unexpected Places. by Gerald F. Reid, Western Historical Quarterly, 2023;, whad027, is available online at: https://doi.org/10.1093/whq/whad027

Chief Thunderwater: An Unexpected Indian in Unexpected Places. By Gerald F. Reid. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2021. Vii +188 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index \$34.95)

Gripping, freshly unearthed research often reads like a detective story. This example of superb sleuthing is no exception. Gerald Reid has taken a second at a figure buried under narratives from the past and gifted to readers a revealing, painstakingly supported and nuanced version of his story. Anyone interested in the political history of the Haudenosaunee (Iroquois/Six Nations Confederacy) across the North-eastern region, or in the battles over status and identity that have always been central to the assertion of Indian rights, or in well-told histories of personal and political Indigenous resilience and resistance, will find this book fascinating.

Reid has applied Phil Deloria's injunction in his 2004 text *Indians in Unexpected Places* that we must resist the force of stereotype and look for "secret histories' of Indian presences within modernity. This has led him to see beyond the "dirty tricks" campaign the Canadian Department of Indian Affairs orchestrated prior to 1920 against Chief Thunderwater (1865-1950) that depicted him as and as a non-Indigenous Black man and as an imposter out for personal gain. Reid makes a persuasive case for Thunderwater in fact being a long-term Native advocate who worked to improve the rights and image of Indigenous peoples in the United States and Canada. He helped Seneca and Tuscarora people in Buffalo and on reservations in western New York State from 1910, and in 1914, established The Council of the Tribes, a Cleveland-based pan-tribal Indigenous rights and self-help organization.

What spooked the Canadian government was his political work for the Haudenosaunee (Iroquois/Six Nations Confederacy) in Canada. His organization did much to advance Haudenosaunee sovereignty and to restore traditional government at Akwesasne, Kahnawake, and Kanehsetake in Southern Quebec and Tyendinaga and Grand River in Southern Ontario. It rankled Ottawa that Thunderwater spearheaded a movement that defied the First Nations political assimilation imperative enshrined in the 1869 Enfranchisement Act. Instead of elections amongst adult males for limited terms of three years, Thunderwater and many others asserted Haudenosaunee inalienable rights to traditional councils of hereditary chiefs, to inclusive government where women were permitted to vote and to Clan Mothers having their central and customary role. They reminded Canada of the principle of kaswentha, of the long-established British commitment to "remain in their own vessel", and invoked the Covenant Chain relationship between Great Britain and the Six Nations that is centred on peace, friendship and support. Predictably, Thunderwater's activities, which included disagreement with Great Britain's decision to embark in 1914 upon a war "for gold" with Germany, attracted the ire of prowar, assimilationist figures such as Seneca intellectual Arthur C. Parker. Parker, who held strong anti-Black views, was utterly convinced Thunderwater was an imposter, but Thunderwater remained active amongst Haudenosaunee communities until at least 1922.

My sincere hope is that this writer keeps researching in this vein – perhaps next with a book on the Oneida figure Laura "Minnie" Cornelius Kellogg who also advanced Haudenosaunee nationalism, and that he continues to provide ever more orientating context in his work

alongside wonderful granular detail. This is an important recontextualization of a complex and significant figure.

Joy Porter Treatiedspaces.com, University of Hull, UK