



The first use of Fulton's K for assessing and comparing the conditions of intertidal fish populations

Journal:	<i>Marine Ecology</i>
Manuscript ID:	MAE-2026
Manuscript Type:	Regular Paper
Date Submitted by the Author:	09-Feb-2014
Complete List of Authors:	Barrett, Chris; Cefas, Applied Fisheries Science & Technology Johnson, Magnus; University of Hull, CEMS Hull, Sue; University of Hull, CEMS
Keywords:	Condition, lipophrys pholis, taurulus bubalis, intertidal, rocky shore, Fulton's K

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

This is the peer reviewed version of the following article: Barrett, C. J., Johnson, M. L., Hall, N. J. and Hull, S. L. (2016), The first use of Fulton's K for assessing and comparing the conditions of inter-tidal fish populations. *Mar Ecol*, 37: 42–45., which has been published in final form at <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/maec.12234/abstract>. This article may be used for non-commercial purposes in accordance with Wiley Terms and Conditions for Self-Archiving.

23 **'Problem'**

24 Research has never before looked at the condition of intertidal fish species, although such
25 analysis may aid in a better understanding of their ecology, ecosystem's health, and
26 ecosystem's productivity. Condition is related to reproductive success (Morgan, 2004),
27 whereby poor condition can result in lower fecundity and skipped spawning and therefore,
28 'good' fish condition may be indicative of optimal morphological adaptation in response to
29 environmental conditions, predator avoidance and prey capture. Poor conditions may
30 indicate anthropogenic or natural disturbance (Horn *et al.*, 1999) and may also affect
31 ecosystem productivity. For example, in the North Sea (ICES area IVb) the shanny/common
32 blenny (*Lipophrys pholis*) have been shown (Pinnegar & Platts, 2011) to contribute to the
33 diet of cod (*Gadus morhua*), and in the Barents Sea (I) and Greenland Sea (IIb), the long-
34 spined scorpion fish (*Taurulus bubalis*) have been found to contribute to the diets of
35 haddock (*Melanogrammus aeglefinus*) and *G. morhua*, respectively (Pinnegar & Platts,
36 2011). The consumption of poor-conditioned specimens of such intertidal fish may result in
37 poorer condition of commercial fish, or may force a shift in their diet to combat such a
38 result, although the extent of the aftermath of such a scenario is not definitive.

39 The aim of this research is to determine whether Fulton's K condition factor could be used
40 to assess differences in the condition of intertidal fish species of the U.K., between
41 populations. Other determinants of assessing condition were considered, such as the
42 Relative Condition Factor (LeCren, 1951) and Relative Weight (Wege & Anderson, 1978),
43 but dismissed. The former requires the use of a 'predicted, length-specific mean weight'
44 (Blackwell *et al.*, 2000) per population, and a difference in this value would create
45 difficulties when comparing between populations. The latter requires defining a 'standard
46 weight' by taking the average weight from a high number of fish from different
47 populations. As this, similar to the other formulas, is usually applied to commercial fish,

1
2
3 48 where huge (>28,000 in the case of Morgan (2004), for example) abundances can be caught
4
5 49 and analysed with ease, determining what is a 'high' number of intertidal fishes is
6
7 50 debatable and so for caution, the Relative Weight formula was not applied.
8
9

10
11
12
13 51

14 52 **'Study Area'**

15
16 53 Filey Brigg (North Yorkshire; Fig. 1) protrudes east–west from the north end of Filey Bay. It
17
18 54 is approximately 1.5 km long, with a southern side ($54^{\circ}13'00''\text{N } 00^{\circ}15'58''\text{W}$) sheltered
19
20 55 from northerly and westerly prevailing winds, and a northern side ($54^{\circ}13'01''\text{N}$
21
22 56 $00^{\circ}16'17''\text{W}$) exposed to the prevailing north-easterly winds.
23
24

25
26 57 Thornwick Bay (Fig. 1), also located in Yorkshire at $54^{\circ}07'53''\text{N } 00^{\circ}06'51''\text{W}$, features
27
28 58 regionally rare intertidal and subtidal chalk reefs, sea caves and sea-cliff vegetation
29
30 59 (Solandt and Lightfoot, 2010). It is ~0.25 km shore length, and surrounded by chalk cliffs. A
31
32 60 freshwater stream runs onto the Bay from the south cliffs, which may influence local
33
34 61 community structure in the immediate vicinity.
35
36

37 62 The rocky shore at Penrhos (Anglesey; Fig. 1) is located at $53^{\circ}18'13''\text{N } 04^{\circ}36'45''\text{W}$. The
38
39 63 shore is 0.9 km long, with the busy ferry port of Holyhead 0.4–1.3 km to the northwest. The
40
41 64 shore is only exposed to the north, because it is protected by the mainland of Anglesey to
42
43 65 the east and south, and by Holyhead and the 2.4km-long breakwater to the west and
44
45 66 northwest, respectively.
46
47

48
49 67 Anglesey's rocky shore of Rhosneigr (Fig. 1) is 0.38 km long, situated at $53^{\circ}13'06''\text{N}$
50
51 68 $04^{\circ}30'36''\text{W}$, and exposed to the west and the south, with limited shelter from the
52
53 69 Abberfraw headland to the south, but sheltered by sand-dunes on the landward side.
54
55

56 70
57
58
59
60

71 **'Methods'**

72 The methodology is that of Barrett *et al.*, (2013); specimen collection from all sites took
73 place over a week of spring tides in August 2010 (summer) and January 2011 (winter) and
74 fish were collected from small pools with the use of hand-nets (Gibson, 1999), and from
75 larger pools using home-made fish traps (Gibson, 1999). For minimal distress (Griffiths,
76 2000), captured fish were anaesthetised in a solution of clove oil in seawater (Horn *et al.*,
77 1999). Once all obvious activity ceased, the fish were placed in sample containers with a
78 solution of 4% formalin in seawater (Tucker and Chester, 1984) and taken to the
79 laboratory.

80 Specimens were left for 3 days in 4% formalin and then transferred to 70% ethanol for
81 another few days. Once the fixing process was complete, specimens were dried between
82 paper towels to remove excess ethanol, dissected and the entire digestive tract removed.
83 Then, the two more abundant specimen species (*L.pholis* and *T.bubalis*) were weighed (g)
84 on an electronic balance, to two decimal places, and their Total Lengths (TL) were recorded
85 (mm) using callipers.

86 A limitation of using Fulton's condition factor is that, as different species have different
87 body shapes, the value ranges of K will be different (Blackwell *et al.*, 2000), thereby making
88 comparisons between different species inaccurate. Therefore, the two species were tested
89 separately. For each species, condition of specimens between seasons and sites were
90 tested using the non-parametric, Mann-Whitney U test, as data was not normal and
91 columns were of unequal lengths (Dytham, 2011), using Minitab 14 software. This was
92 done to test whether between shores and seasons of a coast, the conditions of a given fish
93 species did not significantly differ.

94

1
2
3 95 Table 1 displays the numbers of specimens used for condition analyses. It should also be
4
5 96 noted that *T. bubalis* were not present at Rhosneigr and Penrhos during the winter months,
6
7 97 and so seasonal comparisons at these sites could not be made for this species. The metric
8
9 98 formula of Fulton's condition factor (*K*) was adapted to:

10
11
12
13 99
$$K = (W/L^3) \times 10^5$$

14
15 100 Where *K* = the condition factor, *W* = gutted weight (g), *L* = Total length (mm) and 10^5 =
16
17 101 scaling constant. The use of such scaling constants were used by previous authors (e.g.
18
19 102 Blackwell *et al.*, 2000; Fernandez-Jover *et al.*, 2007), and allows whole values of *K* to be
20
21 103 compared rather than having values <1, especially in the case of the small weights and sizes
22
23 104 of many intertidal fish, such as those sampled in the current research. Length (total) was
24
25 105 cubed, based on the assumption that as a fish grows, it does so in three dimensions: in its
26
27 106 length, depth and breadth.

28
29
30
31 107

32
33
34 108 **'Results'**

35
36
37 109 *L. pholis* were in a significantly higher condition in summer (median = 10, range = 52-543)
38
39 110 than winter (median = 9.7, range = 48-80) in Filey (Mann Whitney U-test, *W* = 2206.5, *df* =
40
41 111 50,29, *P* <0.05) and the same pattern was shown at Thornwick Bay (summer median = 11,
42
43 112 range = 61-845; winter, median = 9.6, range = 56-85): Mann Whitney U-test, *W* = 2132, *df* =
44
45 113 50 & 23, *P* = <0.001).

46
47
48
49 114 *T. bubalis* were also in significantly better condition during summer at Thornwick Bay
50
51 115 (summer median = 17, range = 100-178; winter, median = 15, range = 80-138): (Mann
52
53 116 Whitney U-test, *W* = 618, *df* = 23 & 20, *P*<0.05), but no significant difference was found at
54
55 117 Filey between seasons.

1
2
3 118 On the west coast, *T. bubalis* were in significantly better condition at Rhosneigr, during the
4
5 119 summer (median = 21, range = 15-429) than Penrhos, during the summer (median = 14,
6
7 120 range = 85-143), (Mann Whitney U-test, $W = 252$, $df = 15 \& 10$, $P < 0.05$). In comparison, this
8
9 121 condition of *L. pholis*, and *T. bubalis*, did not differ significantly between summer and
10
11 122 winter at either of the two shores. Conditions of all remaining shores and seasons between
12
13 123 the two fishes, proved non-significant.
14
15
16
17 124

125 **'Discussion'**

126 The research has identified Fulton's K as a suitable condition factor for assessing and
127 comparing the condition of intertidal fish species, and this study could act as a baseline for
128 prospective studies on the same fish species.

129 The study suggests that as *L. pholis* did not differ in condition between seasons around the
130 Anglesey coast, it could be assumed that the Welsh population is maintaining a phenotype
131 which is allowing better ecological success than the English population, as their condition is
132 not hindered during the adverse winter season. When the larger specimens of intertidal
133 fish migrate offshore, either to forage or conforming to the 'Pool Load Capability'
134 hypothesis of Monteiro *et al.*, 2005, from a commercial fisher's perspective, this may be of
135 ecological importance. If the findings of Pinnegar and Platts (2011) are also true of Welsh,
136 Irish Sea, commercial fish species, and the intertidal fish species contribute highly to their
137 diet, the commercial species may be in a 'good' condition as a result, and would therefore
138 fetch a greater market value.

139 It should also be considered that the 'good' condition of Anglesey intertidal fish may be
140 indicative of greater prey availability and more optimal environmental conditions. This is

1
2
3 141 further implied by both species never being in the better condition during the winter
4
5 142 season; only ever the same condition, or poorer.
6
7
8 143 To identify the potential cause(s) for the conditions determined by the current study, and
9
10 144 to explain why English fish did not maintain as good a condition as the Welsh fish, future
11
12 145 research would ideally need to incorporate fish morphologies (Webster *et al.*, 2011);
13
14 146 environmental parameters (Wilson (1990 & 2011); prey availability and abundance
15
16 147 (Armstrong & McGehee, 1980); and sex and maturities (Lloret *et al.*, 2002).
17
18
19
20 148

21
22
23 149 **Summary**

24
25 150 As contributors to the diet of commercial fish species such as cod (*Gadus morhua*) and as
26
27 151 important prey items of the sea otter (*Enhydra lutris*), the current study could be used to
28
29 152 help predict populations of said predators. Where intertidal fish condition is seen to be
30
31 153 'poor,' it may be predicted that predator condition/health (with particular regard to *E.*
32
33 154 *lutris*, which consumes *T. bubalis* in large quantities) may deteriorate and may cause a
34
35 155 trade-off between conserving energy and foraging less (thus reducing energy gains) and
36
37 156 increasing foraging time to consume more of the low-conditioned intertidal fish and
38
39 157 spending more energy in the process. The study could be combined with the conceptual
40
41 158 model of fish coexistence by Barrett *et al.*, (2014), to help managers establish and maintain
42
43 159 a diverse and healthy population of intertidal fishes.
44
45
46
47

48 160

49
50
51 161

52
53
54 162

55
56
57 163
58
59
60

1
2
3 164 **Acknowledgements**
4
5

6 165 Thanks and gratitude to Dr Andy Payne and Dr Jim Ellis, for giving their time to improve the
7
8 166 original manuscript, and to Dr Tim Grabowski, for past correspondence regarding fish
9
10 167 condition.
11
12

13 168

14
15
16 169 **References cited**
17

18
19 170 Armstrong, R.A., McGehee, R. (1980) Competitive Exclusion. *American Naturalist*, **115**,
20
21 171 151-170.
22

23
24 172

25
26
27 173 Barrett, C.J., Johnson, M.L., Hull, S.L. (2013) Diet as a mechanism of coexistence between
28
29 174 intertidal fish species of the U.K. *Journal of Fish Biology*, (IN REVIEW).
30
31

32 175

33
34
35 176 Barrett, C.J., Johnson, M.L., Hull, S.L. (2014) Intertidal fish of the U.K.: Mechanisms of
36
37 177 coexistence. *Marine Ecology*, (IN REVIEW).
38
39

40 178

41
42
43 179 Blackwell, B.G., Brown, M.L., Willis, D.W. (2000) Relative weight (Wr) status and current use
44
45 180 in fisheries assessment and management. *Reviews in Fisheries Science*, **8**, 1-44.
46
47

48 181

49
50
51 182 Crisp, D.J. (1964) The effects of the Severe Winter of 1962-1963 on Marine Life in Britain.
52
53 183 *Journal of Animal Ecology*, **33**, 165-210.
54

55
56 184
57
58
59
60

- 1
2
3 185 Dytham, C. (2011) *Choosing and using Statistics: A Biologist's Guide: Third Edition*, Wiley-
4
5 186 Blackwell, Sussex, U.K.: 23-29 pp.
6
7
8 187
9
10 188 Fernandez-Jover, D., Jimenez, J,A.L., Sanchez-Jerez, P., Bayle-Sempere, J., Casalduero, F.G.,
11
12 189 Lopez, F.J.M., Dempster, T. (2007) Changes in body condition and fatty acid composition of
13
14 190 wild Mediterranean horse mackerel (*Trachurus mediterraneus*, Steindachner, 1868)
15
16 191 associated to sea cage fish farms. *Marine Environmental Research*, **63**, 1-18.
17
18
19 192
20
21 193 Horn, M.H., Martin, K.L.M., Chotkowski, M.A. (1999) *Intertidal Fishes: Life in Two Worlds*,
22
23 194 Academic Press, San Diego: 118-145 pp.
24
25
26 195
27
28 196 Hull, S.L. (1999) Comparison of tidepool phytal ostracod abundance and assemblage
29
30 197 structure on three spatial scales. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, **182**, 201-209.
31
32
33 198
34
35 199 LeCren, E. D. (1951) The Length-Weight Relationship and Seasonal Cycle in Gonad
36
37 200 Weight and Condition in the Perch *Perca fluviatilis*. *Journal of Animal Ecology*, **20**, 201-
38
39 201 219.
40
41
42 202
43
44 203 Lloret, J., Gil de Sola, L., Souplet, A., Galzin, R. (2002) Effects of large-scale habitat variability
45
46 204 on condition of demersal exploited fish in the north-western Mediterranean. *ICES Journal*
47
48 205 *of Marine Science*, **59**, 1215-1227.
49
50
51 206
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 207 Monteiro, N.M., Quinteira, S.M., Silva, K., Vieira, M.N., Almada, V.C. (2005) Diet preference
4
5 208 reflects the ontogenetic shift in microhabitat use in *Lipophrys pholis*. *Journal of Fish*
6
7 209 *Biology*, **67**, 102-113.

8
9 210

10
11 211 Morgan, J.M. (2004): The relationship between fish condition and the probability of
12
13 212 being mature in American plaice (*Hippoglossoides platessoides*). *ICES Journal of Marine*
14
15 213 *Science*, **61**, 64-70.

16
17 214

18
19 215

20
21 216 Pinnegar, J.K., Platts, M. (2011): *DAPSTOM - An Integrated Database & Portal for Fish*
22
23 217 *Stomach Records. Version 3.6*. Centre for Environment, Fisheries & Aquaculture Science,
24
25 218 Lowestoft, UK.: 35 pp.

26
27 219

28
29 220

30
31 221 Webster, M.W., Atton, N., Hart, P.J.B., Ward, A.J.W. (2011): Habitat-Specific Morphological
32
33 222 Variation among Threespine Sticklebacks (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*) within a Drainage Basin.
34
35 223 *PLoS. ONE*. **6**, e21060.

36
37 224

38
39 225

40
41 226 Wege, G.W., Anderson, R.O. (1978) Relative Weight (W_r) a new index of condition for
42
43 227 largemouth bass. In: Willis, D.W., Guy, C.S. (1991): Development and evaluation of a
44
45 228 Standard Weight (W_s) equation for yellow perch. *North American Journal of Fisheries*
46
47 229 *Management*, **11**, 374-380.

48
49 230
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 231 Wilson, J.B. (1990) Mechanisms of species coexistence: twelve explanations for
4
5 232 Hutchinson's 'paradox of the plankton': evidence from New Zealand plant communities.
6
7 233 *New Zealand Journal of Ecology*, **13**, 17-42.
8
9

10 234

11
12
13 235 Wilson, J.B. (2011) The twelve theories of co-existence in plant communities: the doubtful,
14
15 236 the important and the unexplored. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, **22**, 184-195.
16
17

18 237

19
20 238

21
22 239

23
24
25
26 240 **FIGURE 1 Legend**

27
28
29 241 *Figure 1: The location and proximity of the sites sampled along the Yorkshire coast and*
30
31 242 *around the Anglesey coast (Barrett et al., 2013).*
32
33

34 243

35
36 244

37
38 245

39
40 246

41
42 247

43
44 248

45
46 249

47
48 250

49
50 251

1
2
3 252
4
5
6 253
7
8 254
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

For Peer Review

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60



161x62mm (96 x 96 DPI)

Peer Review

Table 1: Numbers of specimens used for condition analysis

Shore/Season	<i>Lipophrys pholis</i>	<i>Taurulus bubalis</i>
Filey summer	50	28
Filey winter	29	7
Thornwick Bay summer	49	23
Thornwick Bay winter	23	20
Rhosneigr summer	32	15
Rhosneigr winter	6	0
Penrhos summer	11	10
Penrhos winter	3	0